Addressing Complex Social Problems through Collective Impact

Workshop for: National Assembly of State Arts Agencies Leadership Institute

October 18, 2013
Meet Justin
Asthma Represents a Complex Social Problem
FSG is a Nonprofit Consulting Firm and a Leader in Collective Impact Thinking and Implementation

- **Nonprofit consulting firm** specializing in strategy, evaluation and research
  - Partner with foundations, corporations, nonprofits, and governments to develop more effective solutions to the world’s most challenging issues
  - Recognized **thought leader** with multiple articles published in *HBR, SSIR, Chronicle of Philanthropy, and the American Journal of Evaluation*

- **FSG articles have paved the way for Collective Impact**

- **FSG understands how to enable and sustain Collective Impact efforts through our work with clients** in the following sectors:
  - Economic development
  - Education reform
  - Environmental sustainability
  - Juvenile justice
  - Teen substance abuse
Goals for Today’s Meeting

1. What is collective impact?
2. How does collective impact work?
3. What role can state arts agencies play in collective impact efforts?
Goals for Today’s Meeting

1. What is collective impact?

2. How does collective impact work?

3. What role can state arts agencies play in collective impact efforts?
There Are Several Types of Problems

Simple
- Baking a Cake

Complicated
- Sending a Rocket to the Moon

Complex
- Raising a Child

Source: Adapted from “Getting to Maybe”
Our Traditional Approach to Complex Problems

- Funders select **individual grantees**
- Organizations **work separately** and **compete**
- **Evaluation** attempts to **isolate** a particular organization’s impact
- Large scale change is assumed to depend on **scaling organizations**
- Corporate and government sectors are often **disconnected** from foundations and nonprofits
A Different Approach

- All working toward the **same goal** and measuring the same things
- Cross-sector alignment with government, nonprofit, philanthropic and corporate sectors as partners
- Organizations actively **coordinating** their action and sharing lessons learned
Collective Impact is the commitment of a group of important actors from different sectors to a common agenda for solving a specific social problem.

## Achieving Large-Scale Change through Collective Impact Involves Five Key Elements

1. **Common Agenda**
   - Common understanding of the problem
   - Shared vision for change

2. **Shared Measurement**
   - Collecting data and measuring results
   - Focus on performance management
   - Shared accountability

3. **Mutually Reinforcing Activities**
   - Differentiated approaches
   - Coordination through joint plan of action

4. **Continuous Communication**
   - Consistent and open communication
   - Focus on building trust

5. **Backbone Support**
   - Separate organization(s) with staff
   - Resources and skills to convene and coordinate participating organizations

Source: Channeling Change: Making Collective Impact Work, 2012; FSG Interviews and Analysis
The Collective Impact Approach Can Apply to Solving Many Complex Social Issues

- **Education**
  - Ready by 21
  - People1st
  - CGER
  - Strive
  - Together

- **Health**
  - Gain
  - Roll Back Malaria Partnership
  - LiveWell Colorado
  - Shape Up Somerville

- **Homelessness**
  - Calgary Homeless Foundation
  - Home Again
  - Only a Home Ends Homelessness

- **Youth Development**
  - New York State:
    - DCIS
    - Communities that Care

- **Economic Development**
  - The Staten Island Foundation
  - Opportunity Chicago
  - MARS

- **Community Development**
  - Elizabeth River Project
  - Magnolia Place

* Indicates FSG Client
Roundtable Discussions

1. Introduce yourself to the others at your table:
   • Name?
   • Organization?
   • Which aspects of collective impact most resonate with you?
Goals for Today’s Meeting

1. What is collective impact?
2. How does collective impact work?
3. What role can state arts agencies play in collective impact efforts?
The “How-to” of Collective Impact

✓ Pre-conditions for Success
✓ Mindset Shifts
✓ Timeline
✓ Organizational Structure
✓ Backbone Responsibilities
Launching a Collective Impact Initiative Has Three Prerequisites

**Influential Champion**
- **Commands respect** and engages cross-sector leaders
- **Focused on solving problem** but allows participants to figure out answers for themselves

**Financial Resources**
- **Committed** funding partners
- **Sustained funding** for at least 2-3 years
- **Pays for** needed infrastructure and planning

**Urgency for Change**
- **Critical problem** in the community
- **Frustration** with existing approaches
- **Multiple actors** calling for change
- **Engaged funders and policy makers**

Source: Channeling Change: Making Collective Impact Work, 2012; FSG Interviews and Analysis
Working in Collective Impact Requires a Mindset Shift

Technical Solutions to Problems → Adaptive Solutions to Problems

Silver Bullet → Silver Buckshot

Attribution → Contribution

Source: Channeling Change: Making Collective Impact Work, 2012; FSG Interviews and Analysis
Collective Impact Efforts Tend to Develop over Three Key Phases

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Components for Success</th>
<th>Phase I Initiate Action</th>
<th>Phase II Organize for Impact</th>
<th>Phase III Sustain Action &amp; Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Governance and Infrastructure</td>
<td>Develop group, structure communication, and decision making</td>
<td>Create infrastructure (backbone and processes)</td>
<td>Facilitate and refine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic Planning</td>
<td>Map the landscape and use data to make case</td>
<td>Create common agenda (goals, strategy)</td>
<td>Support implementation (alignment to goal and strategies)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Involvement</td>
<td>Facilitate community outreach</td>
<td>Engage community and build public will</td>
<td>Continue engagement, conduct advocacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation and Improvement</td>
<td>Analyze baseline data to identify key issues and gaps</td>
<td>Establish shared metrics (indicators, measurement, and approach)</td>
<td>Collect, track, report progress (process to learn and improve)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Channeling Change: Making Collective Impact Work, 2012; FSG Interviews and Analysis
Collective Impact Is Best Structured with Cascading Levels of Collaboration

- **Common Agenda**
  - Governance, Vision, and Strategy
  - Action Planning
  - Implementation
  - Public Will

- **Shared Measures**

**Backbone**
- Steering Committee
- Working Groups
- Partners
- Community Members

**Source:** FSG Interviews and Analysis
Backbone Organizations Are Critical to All Collective Impact Efforts, and They Perform Six Major Functions

- Guide Vision and Strategy
- Support Aligned Activities
- Establish Shared Measurement Practices
- Build Public Will
- Advance Policy
- Mobilize Funding

*Backbones must balance the tension between coordinating and maintaining accountability, while staying behind the scenes to establish collective ownership*

Source: FSG Interviews and Analysis
Backbone Organizations Require a Unique Skill-Set to Support Collective Impact Efforts

Highlights of Successful Backbones

• Have a high level of **credibility within the community**
• Serve as **neutral conveners**
• Have a **dedicated staff**
• **Build key relationships** across members of the initiative
• **Focus people’s attention** and create a sense of **urgency**
• Frame issues to **present opportunities and difficulties**
• Use **evaluation as a tool for learning and progress**
• Ensure **coordination** and **accountability**
• Stay “behind the scenes” to **establish collective ownership**

Source: FSG Interviews and Analysis
Common Misperceptions about the Role of Backbone Organizations

- The backbone organization *sets the agenda* for the group
- The backbone organization *drives the solutions*
- The backbone organization *receives all the funding*
- The backbone *can be self appointed* rather than selected by the community
- That backbone is “*business as usual*” in terms of staffing, time, and resources

Source: FSG Interviews and Analysis
### Many Types of Organizations Can Serve as Backbones

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of Backbones</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Funders</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Calgary Homeless Foundation" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Nonprofit</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="CCER" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Existing Nonprofit</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Opportunity" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government Agency or School District</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Share a Smile" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shared Across Multiple Organizations</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Magnolia Place" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steering Committee Driven</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Memphis Fast Forward" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="MARS" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Goals for Today’s Meeting

1. What is collective impact?

2. How does collective impact work?

3. What role can state arts agencies play in collective impact efforts?
**Arts for All Demonstrates a Collective Impact Approach to Arts Education**

### Common Agenda

**Arts for All: Los Angeles County Regional Blueprint for Arts Education**

- **Problem Definition:** Lack of arts education in K12 education is leaving unprepared for 21st century jobs

- **Solution:** To bring about systemic change in the 81 school districts of Los Angeles County in order to implement comprehensive, sequential K-12 arts education for every public school student in the County

- **Participants:** Arts education organizations, school district leadership, employers, policymakers

### Shared Measurement

- Agreed on critical success factors that are reported across the county:
  1. A board adopted arts education policy and plan
  2. An arts education budget of 5% or more of the total budget
  3. District level arts coordinator
  4. A student to credentialed arts teacher ratio of no more than 400:1

### Continuous Communication

- Arts for All Executive Committee and subcommittees meet regularly

### Mutually Reinforcing Activities

The group has four subcommittees, each representing an Arts for All goal:

1. Educational plans and policies
2. Quality Teaching and Learning
3. Policy
4. Aligning Funding

### Backbone Support

- Coalition is hosted at the LA County Arts Commission and the LA County Office of Education

Source: [http://lacountyartsforall.org](http://lacountyartsforall.org)
There Are Several Factors to Consider When Selecting an Area of Focus for a Collective Impact Initiative

- **DEMONSTRATED NEED**
  - Is there a demonstrated need in the local community?

- **SIGNIFICANT ACTIVITY**
  - Is there already significant local activity underway on which the CI initiative can leverage?

- **SUFFICIENT ENERGY**
  - Is there sufficient energy locally among local leaders and key stakeholders on which a CI initiative can be built?

- **NATIONAL EXAMPLES**
  - Are there relevant examples elsewhere that are demonstrated proof points?

The relative importance of each factor varies depending upon the local context and there is no one right answer for how to draw boundaries to your effort.

Source: FSG Interviews and Analysis
In Issue Selection, It May Be Helpful to Consider Relationship Between the Arts and Other Topics

OPINION

Is Music the Key to Success?

By JOANNE LIPMAN
Published: October 12, 2013

CONDOLEEZZA RICE trained to be a concert pianist. Alan Greenspan, former chairman of the Federal Reserve, was a professional clarinet and saxophone player. The hedge fund billionaire Bruce Kovner is a pianist who took classes at Juilliard.

Multiple studies link music study to academic achievement. But what is it about serious music training that seems to correlate with outsize success in other fields?

The connection isn’t a coincidence. I know because I asked. I put the question to top-flight professionals in industries from tech to finance to media, all of whom had serious (if often little-known) past lives as musicians: a connection between their music training and professional achievements.

Example Areas of Focus

• Economic Development
• Cradle to Career Educational Success
• Substance Abuse
• Health
State Arts Agencies Can Engage in Collective Impact Efforts in a Number of Ways

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sample Role</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Catalyst</strong></td>
<td>• Initiate a collective impact strategy as champion, financier, and convener, potentially playing a key role in attracting resources throughout the effort</td>
<td>THE TOW FOUNDATION [Bill &amp; Melinda Gates Foundation]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Backbone</strong></td>
<td>• Organize and coordinate the actions of cross-sector stakeholders to advance collective impact effort</td>
<td>Calgary Homeless Foundation [MARS]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organization</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participant</strong></td>
<td>• Actively participate in collective impact effort, and aligns funding and measurement to the effort</td>
<td>College Spark Washington [The Carol Ann and Ralph V. Haile, Jr. Foundation]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Arts agencies can play a wide range of roles in collective impact efforts, even within these categories*

Source: FSG Interviews and Analysis
1. Worksheet 1: For which issue(s) in your community would collective impact be a promising approach? How could the arts be framed as a critical component of success?

2. Worksheet 2: What roles do you think state arts agencies are best positioned to play in a collective impact effort? (e.g., catalyst, backbone, participant)
Thank You!

To talk more with FSG about Collective Impact:

- Abi Ridgway, Consultant
  abi.ridgway@fsg.org

Collective Impact resources available on FSG’s website:

NEA’s Arts Education & Collective Impact Webinar:
Appendix
Worksheet 1: For Which Issue(s) in Your Community Would Collective Impact Be a Promising Approach?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Consideration</th>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrated Need</td>
<td>• For which issues is your community is there a significant, demonstrated need for system change?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant Activity</td>
<td>• Are there already significant local activities underway upon which a collective impact effort might be built?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sufficient Energy</td>
<td>• For which issues is there significant energy among local leaders and key stakeholders? Who might be an influential champion to a CI effort?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Examples</td>
<td>• Are any collective impact efforts you have seen in other communities that are relevant for your community?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Issues to consider might include:**
- Economic development
- High school completion
- Substance abuse
- Health
- Others!
Worksheet 2: What Role Do You Think State Arts Agencies Are Best Suited to Play in Collective Impact Efforts?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sample Role</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Pros</th>
<th>Cons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Catalyst</td>
<td>• Initiate a collective impact strategy as champion, financier, and convener, potentially playing a key role in attracting resources throughout the effort</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Backbone Organization</td>
<td>• Organize and coordinate the actions of cross-sector stakeholders to advance collective impact effort</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>• Actively participate in collective impact effort, and aligns funding and measurement to the effort</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>